Participatory Budgeting and ICTs

WBIOG
ICT4Gov Program
What role for ICT in participatory budgeting?

1. communication/mobilization
2. remote participation
3. oversight of budget execution
Mobilization to participation
Experiment & results

4 districts

31,000 geo-targeted calls inviting citizens to the PB assemblies

3,000 geo-targeted SMS

16% increase of participation in selected districts

14% decrease of participation in non-participating districts (control regions)
over 80% of participants considered the phone as a useful / extremely useful means for promoting participation in the deliberative process.
effectiveness of different means of communication
Remote participation

http://opdigital.pbh.gov.br/
Belo Horizonte Participatory Budgeting

Since 1993

2.4 million inhabitants

Budget: US$ 43 million

Low participation (≈ 1.5%) = there are costs to participation
Parabéns Belo Horizonte pela espetacular participação, com 124.320 votos!

A Obra 5 - Praça São Vicente com Anel Rodoviário foi eleita a vencedora com 48.739 votos.
e-Participatory Budgeting (e-PB)

Since 2006 (every 2 years)

US$ 11 million

e-Voting (unique identifier: electoral ID)

US$ 1.2 million per public work (e.g. health, education)
Facilitating remote participation

178 public points with trained personnel for assistance

Access provided by supporters

Internet equipped mobile unit (i.e. bus)

42 day voting period
total participants: 172,938

7.5% of inhabitants

10% eligible participants

highest turnout in poorest areas
Parabéns Belo Horizonte pela espectacular participação, com mais de 120.000 votos!

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Internet</th>
<th>Telefone</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Av. José Cândido Silveira / Av. Andradas</td>
<td>10.442</td>
<td>1.298</td>
<td>11.740</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Av. Pedro I com Av. Portugal</td>
<td>17.383</td>
<td>1.999</td>
<td>19.382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Av. Tereza Cristina com Anel Rodoviário</td>
<td>9.570</td>
<td>954</td>
<td>10.524</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portal Sul / Belvedere</td>
<td>33.008</td>
<td>927</td>
<td>33.935</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Praça São Vicente com Anel Rodoviário</td>
<td>42.434</td>
<td>6.305</td>
<td>48.739</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total de votos acumulados: 124.320
Why increase participation through ICTs?

*Increase inclusiveness of the process*

Increase popular support for decisions taken and the process

Function as an entry point to other forms of participation

*Increase political and administrative buy-in: give more visibility to government action*
Oversight of budget execution
### Select Project

**View closed projects**

**Search projects by Theme**

Search for a project: [Search]

**Select Constituency to view its projects:** [Select Constituency] [View Projects]

**Select a Project Title to View Details**

[next 25] [Next 25]

Showing results 1 to 25 of 32490

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Name</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Fund Type</th>
<th>Total Amount On Project</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kajembe High Sch</td>
<td>Mikindani</td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>23,400,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Boreholes in Tudor &amp; Kaa Chonjo Estate</td>
<td>Kaa Chonjo</td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>500,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borehole In Tudor 4, (Spakl)</td>
<td>Sparki</td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>500,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistance To Community Schools (Mreroni, Milimani)</td>
<td>Miritini Loc’n</td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>320,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borehole in Miritini</td>
<td>Miritini</td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>250,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water Project in Portreitz</td>
<td>Portreitz</td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>250,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration</td>
<td></td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>3,763,137.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furniture, Computers/Equipments</td>
<td></td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>1,026,670.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miritini Health Centre</td>
<td>Miritini</td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>3,000,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bokole Health Centre</td>
<td>Bokole</td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>3,000,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buying plot for Bokole health centre</td>
<td>Bokole</td>
<td>CDF</td>
<td>500,000.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**monthly traffic:**

5.700 visits  
4.500 sms queries
South Kivu IT Landscape

16% mobile phone penetration in DRC*

47% estimated access in 2013**

55% DRC population covered by a network including most of South Kivu rural areas

Access to electricity limited in rural area

Population goes to great length to remain connected

Cheap mobile phones widely used, available and best way to reach remote population

*Vodacom 2008
** Goldman Sachs 2011
Cell phone charging in South Kivu
Technical overview

• SMS as THE ICT tool to access population because of its ubiquity and simplicity.

• Partnership with the biggest DRC mobile operator Airtel

• Airtel provides users’ geographic location based on the antenna to which users are attached

• Our SMS IT platform connected to Airtel core SMSC network allowing direct interaction with Airtel users
How SMS are used

To invite, mobilize and sensitize population to PB like a mass media: 100,000 SMS sent

To simplify voting process through our Beta testing of SMS vote (additional voting channel)

To inform population of the voted decision.

And in the future as a way to get back to population and empower them to follow up on the implementation of voted projects district by district.
Beta SMS test

Mobile Voting

1. Send the district name to shortcode 5151
2. Receive list of priorities for the district
3. Send the number associated with chosen priority
4. Receive confirmation SMS thanking you for voting

Vote Finished
Average voting time 1m 45 sec

SMS voting modeled to the community « by district » vote:
Community PB money split equally among districts.

Each district votes for its own priorities priorly listed during district popular meetings.

District priority lists, loaded in the SMS system and feedback tailored per district.

Main need: basic laptop connected to GPRS modem and very low bandwidth.
## Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community</th>
<th>PB Budget</th>
<th>Interventions</th>
<th>Examples</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Luhindja  | USD 79,000| 56            | repair of 54 classrooms (USD 63,000)  
repair of bridge/road (USD 16,000) |
| Bagira    | USD 79,000| 21            | build health center (USD 7,900)  
repair sewage system (USD 2,000) |
| Ibanda    | USD 48,710| 12            | build toilets in local market (USD 7,237)  
water fountain (USD 4,236) |
Dominican Republic: CrossVoice & PB
Citizen feedback platform via web & mobile

- **Receive** updates
- **Report** public service problems
- **Contact** the city administration
- **Monitor** the budget execution and status of public works
- **Visualize** government spending
- **Get statistical information** at the neighborhood level: access to services, poverty, literacy, participants in the PB process…
PB in Jarabacoa

http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qRgBIBQQQI0E
Frontline SMS

Presupuesto Participativo
Ayuntamiento de Jarabacoa

Enviar SMS
1. Tapar carta en César Rey
2. Atrasa y continúe Candelaria y Rincón
3. Otra obra

Últimos eventos

Vista para obra más necesitada en la comunidad, a continuación envíe las opciones. CONTESTA el mensaje con el NÚMERO de la obra.

2. Hola Teresa Tiburcio alivio 1980/11/12 18:05:10
3. Hola Olifina Arceo alivio 1980/11/12 18:05:44
4. Hola Yanel Domínguez alivio 1980/11/12 18:06:10
5. Hola Yanel Domínguez alivio 1980/11/12 18:07:30
6. Hola Nataly Rodríguez alivio 1980/11/12 18:07:50
7. Hola Reina Calderón alivio 1980/11/12 18:08:11
8. Hola Lucía Peraza alivio 1980/11/12 18:09:03
11. Hola Venalino Arceo alivio 1980/11/12 18:10:36
13. Hola Maribel Martínez alivio 1980/11/12 18:11:30
15. Hola Yanel Domínguez alivio 1980/11/12 18:12:17
17. Hola Ramón Tiburcio alivio 1980/11/12 18:15:35
20. Hola Yanel Domínguez alivio 1980/11/12 18:17:00

Estimador de costo: 0,10 €/SMS
Voting on priorities
PERCEPTION ON THE USE OF SMS FOR MOBILIZING PEOPLE

- Very Useful: 78%
- Somewhat Useful: 9%
- Not Very Useful: 3%
- Not Useful: 7%
- No Answer: 3%
PERCEPTION ON THE USE OF SMS FOR VOTING

- 59% Completely in Favor
- 22% Somewhat in Favor
- 7% Against
- 2% Somewhat Against
- 10% No Answer

IN FAVOR OF SMS VOTING
81%
MEANS BY WHICH PARTICIPANTS FOUND OUT ABOUT THE MEETING

- SMS: 60.00%
- Community Leader: 58.89%
- Other People: 17.78%
- Family Member: 16.67%
- TV: 4.44%
- Radio: 4.44%
world PB mapping ($\approx 15\%$)
online resources

PB Facebook group http://groups.to/pb/
PB world mapping http://tiny.cc/pbmapping
ICT&Governance http://twitter.com/participatory
72 FAQ about PB http://bit.ly/72faq
Mobile PB article http://bit.ly/mobilePB
Participedia http://www.participedia.net/